

Strylchuk Olena
degree-seeking of the department
of music history and musical ethnography
of Odessa National A.V. Nezhdanova Academy of Music
Ye_lena@yahoo.com

THE MAIN TENDENCIES OF THE ANALYSIS OF THE WORKS OF O.MESSIAEN IN THE WESTERN MUSICOLOGICAL DISCOURSE

The purpose of the work is the definition of the main directions of the study of the works of O. Messiaen in Western European and American musicology, of leading stylistic generalizations. **The methodology of the research** is based on the system-analytical and comparative method. **The scientific novelty** of the work is to create an interethnic discursive field, in determining the main trends and issues of modern "messiaenian studies". **Conclusions.** Despite the diversity of research work in many languages, unity in the style definition of the works of O. Messiaen is not found. Instead, the identification a conglomerate of stylistic features inherent in the composer's works. The style diversity confirms that the circle of the historical and ethnological interests of Messiaen is wide and is not localized in one national (French) school. Therefore, the peculiarities of the discursive field formed around the personality and works of O. Messiaen include latitude and polyethnicity. The priority quality of style thinking is universalism one can't relate to one of the stylistic directions of O. Messiaen, but he is involved in all at the same time.

Keywords: style, discourse, historiographic and analytical approaches, polyethnicity, universalism, the performing vector.

Стрильчук Олена Степанівна, здобувач кафедри історії музики та музичної етнографії Одеської національної музичної академії ім. А.В. Нежданової.

Основні тенденції аналізу творчості О.Мессіана у західно-європейському та американському музикознавчому дискурсі.

Метою роботи є визначення основних напрямків дослідження творчості О. Мессіана у західно-європейському та американському музикознавстві, провідних стилевих узагальнень. **Методологія дослідження** спирається на системно-аналітичний та компаративний методи. **Наукова новизна** роботи полягає в створенні міжнаціонального дискурсивного поля, у визначенні основних тенденцій та проблематики сучасного «мессіанознавства». **Висновки.** Не зважаючи на різноманіття дослідницьких робіт на багатьох мовах, єдності у стилевому визначенні творчості О. Мессіана не вбачається. Замість цього – виявлення конгломерату стилевих ознак, притаманних творчості композитора. Стилєва розмаїтість підтверджує, що О. Мессіан широкий у своїх історико-етнологічних інтересах та не локалізований в одній національній (французькій) школі. Тому й до особливостей дискурсивного поля, який сформувався навколо особистості та творчості О. Мессіана, відносяться широта та поліетнічність. Пріоритетною властивістю стилєвого мислення стає універсальність: до одного якого-небудь стилєвого напрямку О. Мессіана віднести не можна, та він причетний до усіх одночасно.

Ключові слова: стиль, дискурс, історіографічний та аналітичний підходи, поліетнічність, універсальність, виконавський вектор.

Стрильчук Елена Степановна, соискатель кафедры истории музыки и музыкальной этнографии Одесской национальной музыкальной академии им. А.В. Неждановой.

Основные тенденции анализа творчества О. Мессиаена в западно-европейском и американском музыковедческом дискурсе.

Целью работы является определение основных направлений исследования творчества О. Мессиаена в западно-европейском и американском музыковедении, ведущих стилевых обобщений. **Методология** исследования опирается на системно-аналитический и компаративный методы. **Научная новизна** работы заключается в создании межнационального дискурсивного поля, в определении основных тенденций и проблематики современного «мессиаеноведения». **Выводы.** Несмотря на многообразие исследовательских работ на многих языках, единства в стилевом определении творчества О. Мессиаена не обнаруживается. Взамен этого — выявление конгломерата стилевых признаков, присущих творчеству композитора. Стилєвая пестрота подтверждает, что Мессиаен широк в своих историко-этнологических интересах и не локализован в одной национальной (французской) школе. Поэтому и к особенностям дискурсивного поля, сформировавшегося вокруг личности и творчества О. Мессиаена, относятся широта и полиетничность. Пріоритетным качеством стилєвого мышления становится универсализм: к одному какому-либо стилєвому направлению О. Мессиаена причислить нельзя, но он причастен ко всем одновременно.

Ключевые слова: стиль, дискурс, историографический и аналитический подходы, полиетничность, универсализм, исполнительский вектор.

The relevance of research. Olivier Messiaen is one of the most performed and studied foreign composers of the twentieth century. Over the past decades, foreign musicology has proposed a number of dissertation research, and their authors, arguing among themselves, create a discursive field studies of Messiaen's creativity. In the domestic musicology, the results of foreign studies are reflected very niggardly, which does not allow an objective and holistic approach to the analysis of the work of O. Messiaen.

The purpose of this article is to identify the main directions of the study of the work of O. Messiaen in Western European and American musicology, the leading generalizations of the style of his music.

Presentation of the main material. The music of Olivier Messiaen, which already during the lifetime of the composer became very well-known and performed, attracted the attention of many researchers, music critics, performers and just music experts. In this regard, the composer himself received close attention, who was not limited to composer practice: for many years he taught, in addition to composition, also theoretical disciplines, gave public lectures, wrote articles, was fond of ornithology. In foreign musicology, it has become a tradition to consider individual composer techniques in the context of all the activities of O. Messiaen. The versatility of his personality and the demand for his music (Messiaen did not write «into the drawer» – often he wrote music intended for a specific performance / performers, or to order) gave rise to his own discursive field, both in the study of the works of the composer and in the literary source study. It originated in the 90s of the twentieth century, when researchers began to include their scientific and journalistic historiographic observations in the West European studies of Messiaen's creativity. Until this time, it is already possible to meet some scientific work, very bold and original.

The discursive field around Messiaen can be divided into three different vector directions, which often intersect: **historiographic** (concentrates on biographical data about the composer's personality), **analytical** and **performance art** (concentrates on individual genre areas of the composer's work). The scale of composing activity and the uniqueness of the composer language of Messiaen, with the universalistic orientation of his method, complicated the task of creating an integral concept of his work, including the stylistic. But several attempts still exist.

Music scholars at University of Sheffield, **Peter Hill** and **Nigel Simeone**, in 2005 (at Yale University) published (in English and French) archival photo and text materials [6]

provided to authors by Messiaen's wife, Yvonne Lorio. The publication devoted to the life of the composer and uncovering the unknown pages of his biography is primarily factual and does not seek to give holistic generalizations and conclusions, and therefore it cannot be called exhaustive in creating the creative portrait of the composer. But we have to admit that not a single researcher who turned to the biography of Messiaen does not bypass this work.

A professor at the same university, **Christopher Dingle**, in 2007 wrote a monograph [3] in which attempts were made to summarize and delve into the biographical data of the composer. The monograph, according to Robert Fallon [4] (from his book review), provides the key to understanding the composer's music, but the reader himself has to open the door with this key.

The monograph by **Paul Griffiths** [5] (published in 1985 in London), more than the previous ones, claims to be the author's assessment of the creative path method: he calls Messiaen the first great composer who has gone beyond the boundaries of the Western European tradition, Griffiths relies on both the compositional and the ideological principles of the composer, puts the category of divine and eternal at the forefront. But his generalization of style remains at the level of a statement of the presence or absence of a number of compositional techniques and stylistic features. Repeated references to the treatises of the composer create a false sense of the clue of the style of Messiaen (because in them Messiaen focused on the technique of composition, which he later adhered to only partially).

Three of the above authors (Peter Hill, Nigel Simeone, Paul Griffiths) can be attributed to the older generation, they are characterized by a **historiographic** method (what has objective reasons). Also among the older generation can be called Sherlaw Johnson (perhaps the oldest of the authors mentioned), Vincent Benitez and Siglind Bruhn. These researchers were the first to receive the title of musicologist. Their research papers combine **historiographical** and **analytical** approaches.

The monograph by **Sherlaw Johnson** «Messiaen» [7], written in 1975, is the first significant publication about Messiaen in English. The author covers the entire (until the early 70s) composer's career, speaking about the formation of the musical language of Messiaen, based on the author's «Technique», analyzes the main works and gives musical examples, often resorting to the terms symbolism and surrealism. But the most attention is paid by the author to the recording of birds singing and the «Catalog of Birds».

The works of **Siglind Bruhn** do not cover the entire work of the composer as a whole, but are concentrated around two ideological centers - these are (1) the theme of love and death (Tristan trilogy, «Trois Petites liturgies», «Poemes pour Mi», «Chants de Terre et de Ciel») and (2) religious themes (detailed analysis of piano cycles «Vingt Regards sur l'Enfant-Jesus» and «Visions de l'Amen», an appealing to early religious topics and opera). In the theoretical part of the work (in which there are many musical examples and schemes), references to the «Technique» of Messiaen and other primary sources are often used, and in theosophically oriented materials Bruhn focuses on verbal commentaries of scores (special attention is paid to the citation by the composer of the treatise by Thomas Aquinas «Sum of Theology»). Overcoming the inertia of description, Bruhn speaks out very boldly, arguing with Sherlaw Johnson (from Christopher Dingle's book review).

The main work of **Vincent Benitez** - «Olivier Messiaen: A Research and Information Guide» [1, 2] (1st ed. - 2008, 2nd ed. - 2017) is a scientific information guide that is a systematization with a few comments. All existing (published) materials that have chosen Olivier Messiaen's personality and work as the subject, including a list of primary sources and discography. Among the few French-speaking works, he singles out only the monograph Harry Halbreich «Olivier Messiaen», written by a student of Messiaen back in 1980, and does not take into account more modern publications. The material of this directory is limited to only English-speaking, Germanic-speaking and French-speaking works, which does not allow to call it exhaustive (Christopher Dingle, despite the high appreciation of this work in his book review, is generally critical of this form of publication, regarding the reference book as obsolete before it was published). In his own theoretical works, Benitez considers the color perception of the harmony of Messiaen and his mathematical method, applies the concepts of symbolism and serialism to the work of Messiaen.

The monograph by Harry Halbreich, a Belgian musicologist, is only a lyrical biographical essay about a teacher whose presence is felt on every page (according to French music critic Jacques Lonchamp [8]).

The analytical vector in the study of the writings of Messiaen can be described as mosaic - it breaks down into style tendencies, one-sided interpretations of individual works or cycles. His creative legacy turned out to be so great and diverse that there is still no single method, view, or approach to it as a whole. On the contrary, this vector is replete with a

variety of attempts to find the «keys» to the decoding of ideas and ideas of Messiaen. Such attempts originate in the first author's treatise «Technique of my musical language».

After sufficient development of the historical and biographical sphere, it was the **theoretical/analytical** method that became the main one for the younger generation of English-speaking musicologists. In this range - musicologists who received a scientific degree (PhD) in the 2000s (regardless of age) - these are Christopher Dingle, Vincent Benitez, Robert Fallon, Andrew Shenton, Yves Balmer, Christopher Murray, Stefan Keym. And to their merits can be attributed to the creation of international scientific discourse on the Messiaen. The general scientific field is formed as a result of reciprocal review, preparation of joint publications, participation in foreign conferences and festivals.

Despite the fact that the study of creativity Messiaen is one of several areas / aspects of the activities of **Dingle** (which he identifies himself), the scientist is recognized as one of the leading experts in the field of messianic studies. In addition to scientific and editorial activities (publishing monographs, editing and reviewing collections of articles and books), he was the organizer of the conferences dedicated to Messiaen: in 2002, the International Conference in Sheffield and in 2008 at the Royal Birmingham Conservatoire (on the 100th anniversary of composer), made scientific presentations at *Environs Messiaen: Nature Rendered at the Keyboard* (New York, 2015) and the 49th Annual Conference (2013, London). His original scientific theme is the study and formulation of the problem of the style of the last decade of Messiaen's work (after writing an opera) in his dissertation theses «Style and technique in the last works of Olivier Messiaen». Highlighting the last decade in a separate period, Dingle considers it to be a crisis, pointing out the following changes in his composition technique: in the instrumentation, the bass function and the bass register are almost completely absent; departure from own harmonic principles; fragments of youthful works become parts of the works; appeal to the classic compositional techniques, which is regarded as a manifestation of experimentation, characteristic of the crisis periods in the work of Messiaen. So, during the creative crisis of 1949-1951s Messiaen creates «*Quatre Etude de rythme*» with an attempt to attract the dodecaphony technique and «*Timbres-durees*» in the technique of specific music. Both of these «experiments» did not find a continuation in his further work. After writing the opera, Messiaen creates the orchestral play «*Un sourire*», in some aspects stylized as classicism, in particular with an allusion to the

music of Mozart (which the composer himself dedicates). And in the «Concert a quatre» introduces an instrumental version of «Vokaliz», written in 1935 for voice and piano.

Christopher Dingle together with Robert Fallon as editors and co-authors published a two-volume collection of articles «Messiaen Perspectives» («Messiaen Perspectives 1: Sources and Influences», «Messiaen Perspectives 2: Techniques, Influence, and Reception», 2013), gathered in this edition of the work of the leading «messieanologist scholars» (Christopher Brent Murray, Yves Balmer, Christopher Dingle, Robert Fallon), as well as many other researchers. This joint «intercontinental» work demonstrates the authors' willingness to cooperate and outlines the boundaries of the musicological discursive field (dedicated to the work of Messiaen).

Robert Fallon, being one of the largest scientists of the American continent, is not limited to the study of Messiaen and participates in many publishing projects, one of which is «Messiaen Perspectives». He also gave scientific presentations at the *Environs Messiaen: Nature Rendered at the Keyboard*, participated in the University of Chicago's Messiaen Festival (2008). His scientific views on the works of Messiaen are subjective in nature and hardly fit into the generally accepted idea and understanding of the music of the composer. In his articles «Birds, Beasts, and Bombs in Messiaen's Cold War Mass», «The record of realism in Messiaen's bird style», «Two paths to paradise: reform in Messiaen's Saint Francois d'Assise», Fallon links the common European views on politics (particular, the church) and some of the works of Messiaen, in which the composer's social and political point of view is symbolically «encrypted».

The most planned and coordinated is the performance art vector of the discursive field of Messiaen, in which critical thinking gives way to respectful propaganda of his music, paying first of all tribute to the memory of the great composer (the important role played by the students of Messiaen and those performers with whom the composer collaborated with lives - Sherlaw Johnson, Harry Halbreich, Jon Gillock, Peter Hill and many others.). The surge in concert and festival activities, and behind it, and scientific, in 2008, to the 100th anniversary of the birth of Messiaen, is very symptomatic.

On the eve of the centenary, in 2005–2006 in Boston, Andrew Shenton, a scientist from the University of Sheffield, organized an international conference dedicated named after Messiaen, at which Peter Hill and Nigel Simeone spoke; in 2008, Andrew Shenton, in collaboration with the Royal Birmingham Conservatoire and the Royal Conservatoire of

Scotland, organized an international symposium dedicated to Messiaen (Messiaen 2008 International Centenary Conference).

In the same year, the «Autumn Messiaen» festival was held at the Université de Montréal (which is considered to be the largest French-speaking institute in Canada), which includes scientific seminars and concerts. Performing jubilee festivals were held in London and Chicago.

Since 2011, a festival named after Messiaen takes place in Meije every summer in France, which includes various events: concerts, round tables, seminars, walks, conferences, and also concert-portraits of other composers.

An interesting festival was held in 2015 in Ithaca at Cornell University, entitled «Environs Messiaen: Nature Rendered at the Keyboard» In addition to concerts, forums, lectures, discussions and master classes, in the ornithological building of the university, Messiaen's music was performed simultaneously with live bird singing.

The Paris Conservatory does not forget the name of the composer and teacher: in 1995, thanks to Messiaen's wife, Yvonne Loriot, a foundation was created in his name (Messiaen Foundation), contributing both to the preservation of manuscripts and other archival materials, and the advocacy of his creativity. The Foundation also supports young composers, pianists, researchers and other authors who have written about Olivier Messiaen.

His name is regularly heard at various conferences, but all key thoughts are located in the biographical or historiographic direction. After Claude Samuel, who published a book of conversations with the composer, the names of **Yves Balmer** (professor of music analysis at the Paris Conservatoire) and **Christopher Brent Murray** (teacher of music analysis at the Free University of Brussels) are most noticeable among French-speaking scholars; they are part of the international musicological discourse, but so far they do not occupy a leading position in it.

In 2017 the joint book by Yves Balmer, Thomas Lacote (French organist and composer) and Christopher Brent Murray «Le Modèle et l'Invention: Olivier Messiaen et la technique de l'emprunt» was published. This work was a continuation of many joint articles by young scientists. The book is a theoretical work in which the authors, on 500 pages, try to rethink the technique of the composition of Messiaen, based on his treatises.

Some Siglind Bruhn articles and archival and biographical work by Peter Hill and Nigel Simeone should be added to the number of French-language works, but the amount of

research and printed articles shows that English-speaking (polylingual) authors have surpassed Messiaen's compatriots in developing a scientific approach to his music.

Many works are written in Spanish, Portuguese, Dutch and other Western European languages, and the geography of their writing applies to all continents.

But the unity in the style definition, which fully and accurately represents the poetics of Messiaen, is not yet revealed in the literature devoted to the composer. There are several reasons for this. The most obvious is the lack of time distance, which allows us to offer an objective assessment of the composer's creative heritage.

But the unity in the style definition, which fully and accurately represents the poetics of Messiaen, is not yet revealed in the literature devoted to the composer. There are several reasons for this. The most obvious is the lack of time distance, which allows us to offer an objective assessment of the composer's creative heritage.

The second reason is the plurality of the musical language of Messiaen, which reveals the features of various styles and techniques of compositions. And the literature on Messiaen perfectly reflects the multiplicity of stylistic nominations corresponding to the composer's way of creativity. In general, his creations reveals the features of the following stylistic directions: serialism, surrealism, symbolism, impressionism, avant-garde, modernism, traditionalism, as well as jazz influences, appeal to Indian culture, Bali music, the use of the Gregorian choral.

But they are not integrated into the holistic characteristics of the poetics of the composer. Repeated references of musicologists to the «Technique of my musical language» and «Treatise on rhythm, color and ornithology» do not bring them closer to understanding the process of creating a musical text. In these works, Messiaen tried to «uncover» the technique of his musical language, but these works can be called, rather, a collection of interesting techniques of interest.

The description of his technique of musical writing, which Messiaen gives in his treatises, does not rise to a compositional and aesthetic level, but rather is a representation of technical inventions used in his pedagogical work. And Western musicologists quite agree with this, that in no way brings them closer to the compositional «behind-the-scene look» itself and does not reveal the secrets that made Messiaen's music so popular and performed. This situation shows the best way possible that the composer himself never uses the «technique» alone; moreover, the technique is far from the first place (referring to the fact

that soon after writing the treatise Messiaen began to move away from it). And to reveal the secret of the composer in this way is not only practically useless, but also theoretically inexpedient. It is better, perhaps, to turn to the phenomenon of compositional style and try to clarify the reasons for applying so diverse categories to it.

Conclusions. The stylistic variegation confirms that Messiaen is diverse in its historical and ethnological interests and is not localized in one national French school. Therefore, the features of the discursive field that has formed around the personality and creativity of Messiaen include latitude and polyethnicity. Musicological discourse, of course, develops in resonance with the style ideas of Messiaen. It is impossible to count Messiaen among any stylistic direction, on the contrary, he is involved in all at the same time. But at the same time, it does not dissolve in different styles, but rather, the signs of different styles dissolve in its unique / universal author's metastyle, over the definition - the nomination of which still needs to be worked on.

References:

1. Benitez V. (2008). Olivier Messiaen : a research and information guide : New York : Routledge. 334 p.
2. Benitez V. (2017). Olivier Messiaen : a research and information guide : New York : Routledge. 382 p.
3. Dingle Ch. (2007). The Life of Messiaen : Cambridge University Press. 261 p.
4. Fallon R. Book Reviews. (2008). Tempo, 62(246), 67-80. doi:10.1017/S0040298208000284
URL: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0040298208000284>
5. Griffiths P. (1985). Olivier Messiaen and the Music of Time Faber : London. 274 p.
6. Hill P., Simeone N. (2008). Olivier Messiaen. Paris : Fayard. 592 p.
7. Johnson Sh. (1989). Messiaen : University of California Press. 232 p.
8. "OLIVIER MESSIAEN", de Harry Halbreich
URL: http://www.lemonde.fr/archives/article/1980/12/26/olivier-messiaen-de-harry-halbreich_2806701_1819218.html#J5J41R038m6gcyLS.99

Date of submission: 22.03.2017